

Minutes for Hull CPC Meeting: 2/1/21

Call to Order

A Hull Community Preservation Committee meeting was held remotely on Monday, February 1, 2021. It was called to order at 6:30 p.m. by CPC Chair Tammy Best.

(This meeting is being held remotely via GoToMeeting as an alternate means of public access pursuant to an order issued by the Governor of Massachusetts dated March 12, 2020 suspending Certain Provisions of the Open Meeting Law. You are hereby advised that this meeting and all communications during this meeting may be recorded by the Town of Hull in accordance with the Open Meeting Law.)

Committee Attendees

Tammy Best, CPC Chair
Greg Grey, Parks and Rec
Jim Ianiri, at-large
Nathan Peyton, Hull Planning Board
Fulvia Quilici Matteucci, Treasurer
Jim Richman, Vice Chair
Carol Costello, CPC Administrator

Agenda

- Call meeting to order
- Vote on ATM21 recommendations:

Application	Final Request	Proponent	Project Liaison
Carousel wooden railing repairs	\$ 15,000	Friends of the Paragon Carousel	Fulvia
Hampton Playground	\$ 173,000	Town	Greg
Mobi Mats	\$ 10,100	Town	Nathan
Council of Aging Repairs & Restoration	\$ 31,000	Town	Jim R
OS Identification & Wayfinding Signage	\$ 10,000	Town	Tammy
Town Hall Entrance Restoration	\$ 40,000	Town	Jim I
Ft. Revere storyboards	\$ 10,000	William Smyth	Fulvia

- Approval of minutes from meetings held on 01.11.21
- Review and approve any outstanding invoices
- Any additional updates on previous CPA grants/projects
- Adjourn

Review CPC Application

Chair Best addressed the attendees that the point of tonight's meeting was for CPC to review the readiness of the applications that were received. The applicants presented to CPC last month, tonight CPC will be reviewing and deliberating on each project; we welcome questions from the residents. CPC will vote on which project will be moving forward to ATM for final approval. We will keep everyone muted, if you have any questions, use the chat function. Please state name and address for record if you have questions. *Chair Best shared her screen with the presentation of each application.*

Carousel Wooden Railing Repairs

Requesting: \$15K / **PL:** Fulvia

Proponent: Friends of the Paragon Carousel

Fulvia addressed the committee explaining the project. They did a great job with the applications, getting the several quotes to present. The reinstallation of the railings will take place by late spring (April) in time for opening. However, this grant would not be approved until ATM sometime in May; therefore, this is a

CPC meeting minutes present only a summary of what was discussed.
There is also an audio recording of this meeting.

reimbursement grant of CPA funds. They have someone sponsoring the funds to get the work completed in time for the opening. This grant would be categorized recreation, not historical.

The committee discussed the protocol of a reimbursement grant.

Carol: reported on the Coalition response to this question: *"There is no supplanting language in CPA makes it clear that you can't do a reimbursement for projects on municipal property. But the law is completely silent on reimbursing private projects, so the CPC will have to make a decision locally. No matter what you decide, you will definitely need to warn the applicant that there is no guarantee that the money will be successfully appropriated by Town meeting.*

Greg: the way I look at it, the Friends of the Paragon Carousel struggle to keep this operating; they are trying to preserve a little piece of Hull.

Fulvia: we need to communicate the message strongly, it's unusual to request a reimbursement grant but understand the circumstances during this time.

Nathan: we can only do this during a global pandemic.

VOTE: Greg made the motion to approve \$15K for the wooden railing repairs; 2nd by Jim Ianiri – all in favor, unanimous. (*Jim R, Fulvia, Nathan, Tammy, Greg, Jim I*)

Hampton Playground

Requesting: \$173K / PL: Greg

Proponent: Town of Hull - Chris Dilorio – Director of Community Development & Planning

Greg: I believe this project is more than ready, the worries about the flooding have been addressed, they have been without it for a few years. *Chris D Is on another call but can be available if we need him.*

Jim R: has this been in front of Con Comm?

Tammy: not official until they have plans to share; however, Chris Krahforst - Chair of Conservation Commission did express his support for this project.

Nathan: what are we buying if we vote this in, if it is not in the design process yet?

Greg: the playground structure is the only thing that would need a final decision.

Fulvia: how long will this project take?

Greg: I would need to refer you to the others, but we are looking at a final plan within the year and then the project could start. If all goes well, approve at ATM, we are looking at within the year.

VOTE: Jim R made the motion to approve \$173K for Hampton Playground project; 2nd by Greg – all in favor, unanimous. (*Jim I, Fulvia, Nat, Jim R, Greg, Tammy*)

Mobi Mats

Requesting: \$10,100 / PL: Nathan

Proponent: Town of Hull - Chris Dilorio – Director of Community Development & Planning

Nathan: I spoke to Chris Dilorio and there is a lot of support with this project; these mats would be a trial period to see how effective they work, they are so inexpensive, I support this project.

Jim I: who is putting out the mats and maintaining them, DPW?

Susan Mann: (209 Manomet Ave): Vice Chair of Beach Management Committee

Yes, it would be something the DPW would put out every spring and roll them up and bring them in for the winter. The Beach Committee is very support of this project. They are approximately 50-foot path that rolls out, and we are looking to place them in three locations: 5th Street, Kenberma and M Street – all with good public access.

Jim R: feedback from the elderly, they are supportive and 100% for this project.

VOTE: Jim R made a motion to appropriate \$10,100 for the Mobi Mats project, 2nd by Nathan – all in favor, unanimous. (*Jim I, Jim R, Fulvia, Greg, Nathan and Tammy*)

Council of Aging Repairs & Restoration

Request: \$31K / PL: Jim I

Proponent: Town of Hull - Chris Dilorio – Director of Community Development & Planning

Jim R: this building is desperate to be fixed, these are the most pressing needs at the center right now that need attention.

VOTE: Greg made a motion to appropriate \$31K to the Council of Aging Repairs & Restoration, 2nd by Fulvia – all in favor, unanimous. (Jim I, Jim R, Nathan, Greg, Fulvia, Tammy)

Wayfinding Signage

Request: \$10K / PL: Tammy

Proponent: Town of Hull - Chris Dilorio – Director of Community Development & Planning

Tammy: the signage will provide direction on major roads to key open space areas. Open Space areas are not easy to find for the public. If approved at ATM, the signage will take place the summer of 2021, they will follow the current format of other town signage.

Nathan: very supportive of this project - pointing out new opportunity for people to find Open Space/recreation to do; excited that it will blend with other signage in town.

VOTE: Jim R made the motion to appropriate \$10K for the Wayfinding Signage, 2nd by Greg – all in favor, unanimous. (Jim I, Fulvia, Jim R, Greg, Nathan, Tammy)

Town Hall Entrance Restoration

Request: \$40K / PL: Jim I.

Proponent: Town of Hull - Chris Dilorio – Director of Community Development & Planning

Jim I: the important issue is this project needs to adhere to the Secretary of Interior Guidelines; the material needs to be wood.

Fulvia: assuming we all read the coalition opinion that was forwarded to us from Carol. (see attached) CPA funds would be subject to lawsuit later, we need to be sure we are following the right protocol with historic restoration; they need to look for an architect with historic experience or a contractor with historic experiences. It is not replacing the columns with fiber glass. Because we are using CPA historic funds, we need to get the right person with experience with this.

Greg: I would suggest if we move this forward we give more for consultant fees.

Fulvia: what if we wait another year? We should be moving projects forward that are ready with correct requested amounts.

Jim I: the fact that the building has already replaced columns with another material, would this compromise the building and knock it off the historical list?

Fulvia: historically if the building was completely done over, yes; however, most of the building is the original building.

Tammy: should we consider moving this forward to get a consultant in instead of restoring the columns this year?

Jim R: why are we paying \$40K that entire building needs to be replaced. Why are we wasting \$\$ to put new columns and doors when the rest of the building is falling down.

Fulvia: we do not have a plan for the building

Greg: there is no master plan. \$40K was for both sides

Greg: suggest that a motion be made, that they seek outside consultant to guide them through the process, ask that they work with Historic Commission to get consultant to review project and give their recommendation. Add an additional \$5K to the request for this.

Note: A few members did express concern that we are fixing decorative elements, with no long-term/master plan for the building

Comment [TB1]: A few members did express concern that we are fixing decorative elements, but there is no long-term/master plan for the building.

VOTE: Jim I. made the motion to allocate \$40K, plus an additional \$5K which would allow the Town to hire a historic expert to assist with the guidelines of the Secretary of Interior Standards. That they also work with the Historic Commission. Any funds not used will be returned back to the CPA budget.

Ft. Revere Storyboards

Request: \$10K / PL: Fulvia

Proponent: Town of Hull - Chris Dilorio – Director of Community Development & Planning with the help of Bill Smyth

Fulvia: Bill met with the Historical Commission. We support this project. Bill will work with the commission for the content that will be included on the signs.

VOTE: Jim R. made a motion to appropriate \$10K for the Ft. Revere Storyboards, 2nd by Fulvia - all in favor, unanimous. (*Jim I., Jim R., Fulvia, Nathan, Greg, Tammy*)

Conclusion:

Seven out of Seven applications will move to ATM for final approval. The remaining balance of CPA funds will be left in the general budget for future projects.

Greg: mentioned he had a conversation with Stuart Saginor from the Coalition, they offer a 45-minute presentation on bonding projects.

Carol: will follow up with Stuart to schedule the presentation for the committee beginning of April.

Reminder: this is the time, we should be promoting applications for next year, the importance of brining any town-owned worthy project to the BOS for early approval. Also, helpful to meet with respective committee such as Historic, Con Comm, etc.

Tammy: I will create an article for the Times, I will also reach out to Judi Sadie and place something on the CPC website.

Review/Approve Meeting Minutes

Meeting minutes from 1/11 - no discussion/changes

VOTE: Greg made the motion to accept January 11th meeting notes, 2nd by Jim R. (*Fulvia abstained, she did not have a chance to review*) approved - (*Jim R, Nathan, Jim I, Fulvia, Greg, Tammy*). Tammy will request that they be placed on CPC website.

Review/Approve Outstanding Invoices

Carol Costello's Invoice No. 9, dated February 1st.

VOTE: Jim R. motioned to approve, and Greg seconded the motion, (*Fulvia abstained, she did not have a chance to review*) approved. The motion passed and Fulvia will process the invoice with Mike Buckley. (*Jim R, Nathan, Jim I, Fulvia, Greg, Tammy*).

Updates on Previous CPA grants/projects

Boathouse Doors' Restoration ATM 2019 - \$70K grant / PL: Greg

Fulvia: \$70K was granted to the Hull Lifesaving Museum for the restoration of the boathouse doors. Our grant agreements typically state that projects need to be completed within two years from approval. The committee will plan to take a vote at their next meeting, March 1st, as to whether the grant should be rescinded.

Fulvia will follow up with Mike McGurl.

Next CPC Meeting - March 1, 2021

CPC meeting minutes present only a summary of what was discussed.
There is also an audio recording of this meeting.

Adjournment

VOTE: Jim I. moved that the meeting be adjourned at 8:51 pm, 2nd by Greg and approved unanimously.

Respectfully submitted by: Carol Costello with edits by Tammy Best

RESPONSE FROM THE COALITION: [Town Hall Restoration of the Columns](#)

FROM: Jeff Gonyeau (jgonyeau@preservationmass.org)

Carol--good luck with your meeting and with the decision making process. In re-reading my response, I hope it is clear that I think that a case could be made for replacement of the columns, but that the replacements really need to match the size, scale, and design of the originals very closely, since the circulation pattern by them puts the public right up close to them. Sorry if that was not clear.

All the best,
Jeff

From: Jeff Gonyeau <jgonyeau@preservationmass.org>

Date: February 1, 2021 at 11:19:25 AM EST

To: CmcCostello@verizon.net

Subject: Re: Historic Preservation Question

Dear Carol,

Thank you for reaching out to me via the Preservation Mass Circuit Rider program. Given that time is extremely short, I wanted to provide a brief response to your query prior to your CPA vote tonight.

First, as you are no doubt aware, CPA projects are required to follow the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. A good overview of how the Standards relate to CPA projects (along with a link to the Standards) is found on the Community Preservation Coalition's website here: <https://www.communitypreservation.org/SOI-standards>

These Standards stress that, wherever possible, any historic building fabric that cannot be preserved and repaired (repair is always preferable to replacement) and must be replaced should be replaced with features whose design, materials, and workmanship match the original as closely as possible.

From the photos provided, it appears that the 1920s columns on the Hull Town Hall entrances have wood columns and bases, but capitals that seem to be made of a composite material. The capitals are severely deteriorated, and possibly not repairable; the columns (made of wood staves or strips) are split in many places, and probably could be repaired, but perhaps not totally successfully or in a way that would be durable. It is not uncommon for a good case to be made to replace such features with cast resin or fiberglass replicas--but only when the replacements are not merely approximations of the design of the features they are replacing but are careful replications; it is impossible to tell from the cursory contractor proposal submitted with the application how closely the proposed replacements match the original, and they may be stock items from a catalogue. (It would have been preferable for an architect experienced with historic preservation projects to have specified the replacements, instead of relying on a contractor.) Further, when replacement materials are allowed, this is often in cases where the environment is harsh and weather conditions (such as the coastal environment in Hull) may hasten decay of modern wooden replacements, or in cases where the features are high up on a building and not at ground or eye level, where it would be easier to detect that they are made of replacement materials. Since people pass close to these details coming in and out of the building, this makes the use of replacement materials less than ideal.

Given that there is not a lot of time, the above was a bit of a "brain dump." However, I hope it raises some of the questions that the CPC (and the Hull Historical Commission, which supports this project!) should consider when evaluating projects and awarding CPA funds. Projects using CPA funds should always be held to a high technical standard--at the very least meeting the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, which the CPA enabling legislation requires. Ultimately it is up to the CPC to make the decision whether to approve these, but they should apply some rigor to their process, and be cognizant that they may be setting precedents with every decision.

Please let me know if you have any questions, and good luck at your meeting this evening.

All the best,
Jeff Gonyeau

--

Jeffrey Gonyeau
Preservation Circuit Rider

Preservation Massachusetts
Post Office Square / 6 Main Street Ext., Suite 613
Plymouth, MA 02360
Email: jgonyeau@preservationmass.org
Mobile: 617-320-2323
Office: 617-723-3383

CPC meeting minutes present only a summary of what was discussed.
There is also an audio recording of this meeting.